



Human Resources & Workforce Development

To: Rick Fernandez, City Manager
From:  Ellen Blair, Director-Human Resources
CC: Reese Goad, Deputy City Manager
Date: April 25, 2016
Re: Position and Salary Review

As a result of the January 2016 reorganization, several departments were eliminated and duties were changed. Over the last several months, Human Resources staff has reviewed the salary data for the impacted senior level positions. Attached is a list of these positions including salary information pertaining to the current incumbent (Table 1).

The City of Tallahassee is a full service municipality providing electric, natural gas, water, sewer, solid waste, storm water management, airport service, and fire service for the entire county, among other duties. In keeping with Human Resources best practices and in accordance with city compensation policy and guidelines, the methodology used to determine appropriate compensation included a review of both internal and external comparison data. Given the breadth of services provided by the City, not all agencies had comparable positions; therefore, it was not possible to use only a core group of agencies, making it necessary to include comparables from select agencies based on the positions themselves. Florida cities and agencies were used for this analysis. In addition to municipalities generally considered to be comparable to Tallahassee, Florida utilities with like operations including JEA (Jacksonville), Gainesville Regional Utilities, and Kissimmee Utility Authority were contacted as well. In all, data was gathered from 17 agencies, representing 67 data points. This data is summarized in Table 2. Staff also reviewed additional salary information compiled by the American Public Power Association (Table 3). It is preferable to consider market data when making salary recommendations. Positions are considered to have a valid market indicator if there are at least five comparable data points. For those positions with fewer than five data points, consideration is given to both external and internal compensable factors such as budgetary control, employees supervised, level of independence, the position's hierarchy within the organization, etc. Finally, positions with a similar scope of responsibilities may be slotted within similar pay bands based on the above factors.

Recommended Action

For purposes of this analysis, we are fortunate to have numerous comparables and valid market indicators for most of the reviewed positions. Based on this data and the desire to structure City compensation based on duties and responsibilities, staff recommends the salaries by position as shown in Table 4. The table also includes a range of market comparable salaries or an indication that the recommended value is based on internal values only. The total recommended changes represent a change of \$359,988 as compared to a reduction of \$1,059,305 in salaries for those positions that were eliminated, or a net reduction of \$699,317.

I would be happy to follow up with you and discuss the specifics and ideas about implementation at your convenience.

References

Table 1 – Position Review

Table 2 – Salary Comparisons with Other Florida Agencies

Table 3 – APPA 2015 Survey of Salaries in Locally Publicly Owned Utilities

Table 4 – Salary Recommendation

**City of Tallahassee
Position Review**

| Job Title | Current Incumbent | Current Annual Salary |
|------------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Deputy City Manager | Goad, Christopher | \$135,916 |
| Assistant City Manager-ComEng/PS | Barber, Cynthia | \$127,586 |
| Assistant City Manager-Admin/Proff | Lavin, Raoul | \$131,486 |
| Assistant City Manager-Dev/Ec Vita | Tedder, David | \$145,327 |
| General Manager-Electric Utility | Mcgarrah, Robert | \$156,892 |
| General Manager-UU & PublicInfrast | Tadros, Medhat | \$135,986 |
| Chief Customer Officer | Barnes, James | \$120,230 |
| Director Human Resources & Wdev | Blair, Ellen | \$117,098 |
| Mgr-Technology & Innovations | Kilpatrick, Jonathan | \$112,119 |
| General Mgr-ComBeaut&WasteServ | Ofuani, Reginald | \$111,585 |
| Director - Growth Management | Jumonville, Karen | \$118,910 |
| Director-EnvServ&Facilities | Powell, John | \$107,533 |
| Director-Financial Management | Wigen, Robert | \$98,421 |
| Director-Community Relations | Allen Manning, Sandra | \$91,772 |
| Director - Communications | Faris, Alison | \$84,202 |
| Assistant to the City Manager | McCray, Patricia | \$74,950 |

City of Tallahassee
Salary Comparisons with Other Florida Agencies

OFFICE OF CITY MANAGER

| | | | | | | |
|---------|-------------|---------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|
| AGENCY: | Tallahassee | Jacksonville Electric Authority | Lakeland Electric | Gainesville Regional Utilities | Kissimmee Utilities Authority | Orlando Utilities Commission |
|---------|-------------|---------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|

JOB TITLE: Deputy City Manager
 REPORTS TO: City Manager
 SALARY: R. Goad - \$135,915.64

Managing Director a
 JEA Board \$437,174

General Manager (Elect
 City Manager \$209,646

General Manager for U
 City Commission \$287,000

President & General
 Board \$242,486

General Manager and CEO
 Board \$402,840

| | | | | | | | |
|---------|-------------|------------|---------------|-------------|-------|---------------|-----------------|
| AGENCY: | Tallahassee | Clearwater | Daytona Beach | Gainesville | Largo | Pompano Beach | West Palm Beach |
|---------|-------------|------------|---------------|-------------|-------|---------------|-----------------|

JOB TITLE: Assistant City Manager
 REPORTS TO: City Manager
 SALARY: C. Barber \$127,586
 R. Lavin \$131,485
 W. Tedder \$145,327

Assistant City Manag
 City Manager \$143,112

Deputy City Manager
 City Manager \$136,578

Assistant City Manager
 City Manager \$143,641

Assistant City Manag
 City Manager \$129,044

Assistant City Manager
 City Manager \$163,897

Deputy City Administrator
 City Administrator \$200,428

ELECTRIC UTILITIES DEPARTMENT

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---------|-------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------------------|-------------|--------------------------|--------------------------------|
| AGENCY: | Tallahassee | Jacksonville Electric Authority | Gainesville Regional Utilities | Lakeland Electric [1] | Kissimmee Utilities Authority [2] | Orlando Utilities Commission [3] | Keys Energy | New Smyrna Beach Utiliti | Ft. Pierce Utilities Authority |
|---------|-------------|---------------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------------------|----------------------------------|-------------|--------------------------|--------------------------------|

JOB TITLE: General Manager - Electric
 REPORTS TO: Deputy City Manager
 SALARY: R. McGarrah - \$156,892

VP/General Manager
 CEO \$404,227

Chief Operating Officer
 General Manager \$200,000

Electric General Manag
 City Manager \$209,646

VP - Power Supply a
 General Manager \$196,331

VP-Electric and Water Delive
 General Manager \$235,000

VP of Electric and Water Prc
 General Manager \$292,500

General Manager & CEO
 Utility Board \$183,955

General Manager
 Utility Commission \$153,005

General Manager
 Board \$150,000

UNDERGROUND UTILITIES & PUBLIC INFRASTRUCTURE DEPARTMENT

| | | | | | | | | |
|---------|-------------|------------|------------|---------------|----------------------|----------|---------------|-----------------|
| AGENCY: | Tallahassee | Clearwater | Clearwater | Daytona Beach | Gainesville Regional | Lakeland | Pompano Beach | West Palm Beach |
|---------|-------------|------------|------------|---------------|----------------------|----------|---------------|-----------------|

JOB TITLE: GM-Undergrnd Utilities
 REPORTS TO: Deputy City Manager
 SALARY: M. Tadros \$135,986

Public Utilities Direct
 Assistant City Manag \$100,940

Gas Syst Mnging Dir/Exe
 Assistant City Manager \$130,682

Utilities Director
 Business Enterpr Mgmt \$112,000

Water/Wastewater Director
 Chief Operating Offi \$150,500

Director Water Utilities
 Deputy City Manager \$155,785

Utilities Director
 Assistant City Manager \$116,478

Director Public Utilities
 Assist City Administrator \$123,600

CUSTOMER SERVICES DEPARTMENT

| | | | | | | |
|---------|-------------|---------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|
| AGENCY: | Tallahassee | Jacksonville Electric Authority | Lakeland Electric | Gainesville Regional Utilities | Kissimmee Utilities Authority | Orlando Utilities Commission |
|---------|-------------|---------------------------------|-------------------|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|

JOB TITLE: Chief Customer Officer
 REPORTS TO: Deputy City Manager
 SALARY: J. Barnes - \$120,230

Chief Customer Offic
 CEO \$195,000

Assistant GM-Customer
 Managing Director \$130,000

Chief Customer Officer
 General Manager \$132,340

VP - Customer Servi
 General Manager \$158,101

VP - Customer Services
 General Manager \$190,000

HUMAN RESOURCES AND WORKFORCE DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

| | | | | | | | | | |
|---------|-------------|------------|---------------|-----------------|----------|-------|-----------|---------------|-----------------|
| AGENCY: | Tallahassee | Clearwater | Daytona Beach | Gainesville/GRU | Lakeland | Largo | Pensacola | Pompano Beach | West Palm Beach |
|---------|-------------|------------|---------------|-----------------|----------|-------|-----------|---------------|-----------------|

JOB TITLE: Director-HR & Workforce Devel
 REPORTS TO: City Manager
 SALARY: E. Blair \$117,098

Human Resources Di
 Assistant City Manag \$115,827

Human Resources Direc
 City Manager \$139,095

Human Resources Dire
 City Mgr & GM-Utilities \$121,933

HR Director
 Assistant City Manag \$121,443

Human Resources Director
 City Manager \$117,250

Chief HR Officer
 City Administrator \$99,694

Human Resources Director
 Assist City Manager \$122,301

Director Human Resources
 Deputy City Administrator \$135,188

City of Tallahassee
Salary Comparisons with Other Florida Agencies

TECHNOLOGY & INNOVATIONS DEPARTMENT

| | | | | | | | |
|-------------|------------------------------|---------------------------------|--|---------------------------------|---------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| AGENCY: | Tallahassee | Clearwater | Gainesville Regional Utility Authority | Lakeland | Largo | Pompano Beach | West Palm Beach |
| JOB TITLE: | Dir-Technology & Innovations | Information Technology Director | Chief Information Office Director | Information Technology Director | Information Technology Director | Information Technologies Director | Director Information Technology |
| REPORTS TO: | City Manager | Assistant City Manager | General Manager | Deputy City Manager | Assistant City Manager | Assistant City Manager | Deputy City Administrator |
| SALARY: | J. Kilpatrick \$112,119 | \$120,273 | \$151,000 | \$144,807 | \$110,864 | \$128,418 | \$120,000 |

COMMUNITY BEAUTIFICATION & WASTE MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT

| | | | | | |
|-------------|---------------------------|--|------------------------|-------------------------------|--------------------|
| AGENCY: | Tallahassee | Clearwater | Lakeland | Orlando | Pensacola |
| JOB TITLE: | GM-Comm Beaut & Waste Mgt | Solid Waste/General Manager of Solid Waste | Solid Waste Division M | Sanitation/Fleet Mgt Director | |
| REPORTS TO: | Deputy City Manager | Assistant City Manager | Public Works Director | Public Works Director | City Administrator |
| SALARY: | R. Ofuani \$111,585 | \$107,504 | \$87,031 | \$113,859 | \$107,370 |

FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT DEPARTMENT

| | | | | | | |
|-------------|-------------------------------|------------------------|----------------|--|---|--------------------|
| AGENCY: | Tallahassee | Clearwater | Daytona Beach | Gainesville | Lakeland | Pensacola |
| JOB TITLE: | Director-Financial Management | Finance Director | Budget Officer | Finance Director | Office of Mgmt & B: Chief Financial Officer | |
| REPORTS TO: | Assistant City Manager | Assistant City Manager | City Manager | Administrative Services Assistant City Manager | Assistant City Manager | City Administrator |
| SALARY: | R. Wigen \$98,420.53 | \$113,216.31 | \$84,048.00 | \$133,492.22 | \$100,810.00 | \$123,219.20 |

OFFICE OF COMMUNITY RELATIONS

| | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------|-----------------------------|--------------------------|---|--|-------------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| AGENCY: | Tallahassee | Clearwater | Gainesville | Gainesville Regional Utility Authority | Kissimmee Utilities Authority | Lakeland | Orlando Utilities Commission | Pompano Beach | Jacksonville Electric Authority |
| JOB TITLE: | Manager-Community Relations | Public Communication Mgr | Comm & Marketing Assistant City Manager | Director-Communication | VP of Corp Commun | Communications Director | VP-Marketing, Communication | Public Communications Director | Engagement Manager |
| REPORTS TO: | Deputy City Manager | City Manager | Assistant City Manager | General Manager | | City Manager | General Manager | City Manager | Chief Customer Officer |
| SALARY: | S. Manning - \$91,772 | \$96,079 | \$82,574 | \$89,433 | \$126,984 | \$108,112 | \$192,000 | \$95,827 | \$134,368 |

COMMUNICATIONS

| | | | | | | |
|-------------|-------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------------|
| AGENCY: | Tallahassee | Clearwater | Gainesville | Lakeland | Largo | Pompano Beach |
| JOB TITLE: | Director-Communications | Public Communication | Communications & Marketing | Communications Director | Comm & Marketing | Public Communications Director |
| REPORTS TO: | City Manager | City Manager | Assistant City Manager | City Manager | Assistant City Manager | City Manager |
| SALARY: | A. Faris \$84,202 | \$96,079 | \$82,574 | \$108,112 | \$53,159 | \$95,827 |

- 1 Includes customer service functions not in the Tallahassee Electric Department
- 2 Operations, Power Supply, and Engineering functions are combined in the Tallahassee Electric Department
- 3 Delivery and Production functions are combined in the Tallahassee Electric Department

| Table 4H: Annual Salaries by Customer Size Class Publicly Owned Utilities (Excluding Joint Action Agencies), May 2015 | | | | | |
|--|----------------------------|-------------|-----------------------|---------------|-----------------------|
| 4H: Customer Size Class : 100,000 or more | | | | | |
| Occupation | Number of Responses | Mean | First Quartile | Median | Third Quartile |
| General Manager | 12 | 424,860 | 321,386 | 391,917 | 439,639 |
| Assistant General Manager | 6 | 251,216 | b | b | b |
| Chief Engineer | 7 | 168,153 | b | 177,200 | b |
| Director of Power Supply Planning | 9 | 174,606 | 138,409 | 156,780 | 192,552 |
| Supervisory Engineer | 10 | 132,665 | 113,541 | 130,901 | 151,256 |
| Line Division Superintendent | 9 | 145,886 | 125,763 | 141,660 | 152,860 |
| Construction Superintendent | 8 | 111,617 | b | 113,998 | b |
| Chief Financial Manager | 11 | 225,722 | 207,067 | 226,612 | 254,008 |
| Chief Accountant | 9 | 142,705 | 123,280 | 141,278 | 159,994 |
| Rate Analyst | 7 | 91,371 | b | 93,264 | b |
| Personnel Director | 11 | 173,162 | 125,875 | 189,074 | 204,965 |
| Director of Customer Services | 11 | 165,963 | 147,500 | 157,694 | 189,004 |
| Information Systems Manager | 10 | 154,727 | 127,758 | 143,576 | 179,071 |
| Communications Director | 11 | 136,102 | 115,392 | 133,263 | 160,687 |
| Staff Legal Counsel | 8 | 172,749 | b | 165,732 | b |
| Fuels Manager | 6 | 141,000 | b | 130,255 | b |
| Purchasing Director | 11 | 133,951 | 110,064 | 126,320 | 139,140 |
| Marketing Director | 5 | 144,100 | b | 146,260 | b |
| Key Accounts Manager | 8 | 99,715 | b | 93,814 | b |
| Safety Specialist | 9 | 77,294 | 72,662 | 75,860 | 82,810 |
| Electric Engineer | 10 | 89,602 | 82,386 | 86,527 | 101,118 |
| Risk Manager | 6 | 102,059 | b | 106,596 | b |
| Leg. & Gov. Affairs Manager | 7 | 129,355 | b | 128,232 | b |
| Information Technology Analyst | 5 | 93,060 | b | 94,824 | b |
| Cyber Security Officer | 6 | 112,976 | b | 113,779 | b |
| Physical Security Officer | 6 | 59,604 | b | 55,468 | b |

Note b: Quartiles are not calculated for fewer than 9 responses.

City of Tallahassee
Salary Recommendation

| Job Title | Recommended Salary | Market Comparables | |
|-----------------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-----------|
| | 1/22/2016 | Range | |
| Deputy City Manager | \$185,000 | \$209,646 | \$437,174 |
| Assistant City Manager | \$175,000 | \$129,044 | \$200,428 |
| Assistant City Manager-Admin/Pro | \$175,000 | \$129,044 | \$169,502 |
| Assistant City Manager-Dev/Ec Vit | \$175,000 | \$129,044 | \$169,502 |
| General Manager-Electric Utility | \$175,000 | \$150,000 | \$404,227 |
| General Manager-UU & PublicInfra | \$175,000 | \$100,940 | \$155,785 |
| Chief Customer Officer | \$130,000 | \$130,000 | \$195,000 |
| Director Human Resources & Wde | \$130,000 | \$99,694 | \$139,095 |
| Mgr-Technology & Innovations | \$130,000 | \$110,864 | \$151,000 |
| General Mgr-ComBeaut&WasteSe | \$130,000 | \$87,031 | \$113,859 |
| Director - Growth Management | \$120,000 | Internal | Internal |
| Director-EnvServ&Facilities | \$120,000 | Internal | Internal |
| Director-Financial Management | \$120,000 | \$84,048 | \$133,492 |
| Director-Community Relations | \$110,000 | \$82,574 | \$192,000 |
| Director - Communications | \$100,000 | \$53,159 | \$108,112 |
| Assistant to the City Manager | \$80,000 | Internal | Internal |